



Carsten Holz &lt;carstenholz@gmail.com&gt;

---

**Fwd: Initiating grievance procedures against Head of ECON**

7 messages

---

**Carsten Holz** <carstenholz@gmail.com>

Tue, Jan 14, 2014 at 8:40 AM

To: tonyfchan@ust.hk

14 January 2014

From: Carsten Holz, Professor, Social Science Division, HKUST, [socholz@ust.hk](mailto:socholz@ust.hk)To: Professor Tony Chan, President, HKUST, [tonyfchan@ust.hk](mailto:tonyfchan@ust.hk)

Re: Grievance against the Department of Economics, Business School, HKUST

Dear President Chan,

in accordance with the Human Resources Circular No. 3/2011 ("Revised Staff Grievance Procedures"), I forward my grievance to you.

I originally submitted my grievance to the Dean of the Business School, by email on 4 December 2013 and, not receiving an acknowledgment, by registered mail on 5 December 2013. As of today, I have not received a response. The staff grievance procedures in paragraph 13 specify that "if a decision is not reached within the one-month period, he/she [the staff member] may ... appeal to the supervisor's supervisor in writing," which I herewith do.

My original grievance is appended to this email, as well as attached. I am also sending a hard copy by campus mail.

Sincerely,  
Carsten Holz

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Carsten A. Holz <[socholz@ust.hk](mailto:socholz@ust.hk)>

Date: Wed, Dec 4, 2013 at 4:24 PM

Subject: Initiating grievance procedures against Head of ECON

To: [kachan@ust.hk](mailto:kachan@ust.hk), [bmcheng@ust.hk](mailto:bmcheng@ust.hk)

Dear Professor Chan,

please find attached a grievance case which, according to university regulations, I am to address to you.

Equally appended below, in full, without formatting.

I would be grateful if you or your assistant would acknowledge receipt.

Sincerely,  
Carsten Holz  
Prof., SOSC

4 December 2013

From: Carsten Holz, Professor, Social Science Division, HKUST, [socholz@ust.hk](mailto:socholz@ust.hk)

To: Professor Kalok Chan, Dean, Business School,  
HKUST, [kachan@ust.hk](mailto:kachan@ust.hk)

Re: Grievance Procedure against the Department of Economics in the  
Business School, HKUST

Dear Professor Chan,

I herewith initiate grievance procedures against the Department of  
Economics (ECON).

For the academic year 2012/2013, my department (the Social Science  
Division, SOSC) asked me to teach an undergraduate course.

I am an economics PhD.

I proposed to teach Introductory Macroeconomics, a first-year UG  
course, as common-core course in 2013/14. ECON blocked the course on  
27 June 2013. I attempted to resolve the issue by then proposing to  
teach the course as \*non-\*common-core course, and ECON blocked that  
course on 8 October 2013.

The UASC in my full professor review of 2007/2008 denied full  
professorship with the statement "his research record would be  
improved, if he had chosen to publish some manuscripts in  
better-ranked economics journals."

HKUST evaluates my performance as economist but prevents me from  
teaching economics courses. I think this constitutes a double standard  
and meets the criterion for lodging a grievance specified in the Staff  
Grievance Procedures:

"For the purpose of these procedures, "grievance" is defined to be an  
expression of feeling of injustice and unfairness by staff members  
about the treatment received from the management of other University  
staff members which adversely affects their general welfare at the  
workplace and/or their terms and conditions of employment at the  
University."

Both my general welfare at the workplace and my terms and conditions  
of employment at the University are severely affected.

This particular instance, when a course I proposed was blocked by ECON, and this particular evidence of I being evaluated as economist, are representative of many such instances, for me (over 18 years) and for others in SOSC. ECON has instituted a virtual blanket veto against economics courses proposed by economics faculty in SOSC and the damage to the general welfare and to the career of economists in SOSC is very substantial.

I request that ECON and the Business School be categorically denied a veto right over course offerings by SOSC faculty members.

I address this grievance, in the first instance, to you in your function as Dean of the Business School, as required by the Staff Grievance Procedures:

"If a grievance is directed against a staff member in another unit, the grievance may be addressed to the Head of Department of that unit or, if a Head of Department in another unit is the source of the grievance, to the Dean or the Branch Head of that unit."

The source of the grievance is the Head of ECON.

Sincerely,

Carsten Holz

[transmitted electronically]

Appended: two emails from ECON vetoing my two course proposals.

>-----Original Message-----

>From: Leonna Tong [mailto:[leonna@ust.hk](mailto:leonna@ust.hk)]

>Sent: Tuesday, October 08, 2013 11:23 AM

>To: Dora Lee

>Cc: [fntfntui@ust.hk](mailto:fntfntui@ust.hk); [yanyu@ust.hk](mailto:yanyu@ust.hk)

>Subject: Re: FW: SOSC New UG NON-Common-Core course proposal/ Solicit  
>ECON's

>concurrence

>

>

>Dear Dora,

>

>As our Department is offering macroeconomics and welcome Global China  
>students to take it, we do not see any any need for concurrence a same  
>course.

>

>Regards,

>  
>Leonna

-----Original Message-----

From: Leonna Tong [mailto:[leonna@ust.hk](mailto:leonna@ust.hk)]  
Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2013 6:32 PM  
To: Dora Lee  
Cc: [michelle.yik@ust.hk](mailto:michelle.yik@ust.hk); [sosn@ust.hk](mailto:sosn@ust.hk); [yanyu@ust.hk](mailto:yanyu@ust.hk); [sfleung@ust.hk](mailto:sfleung@ust.hk)  
Subject: Re: Solicit ECON's concurrence on a new SOSC UG common core course proposal

Dear Dora,

Our Dept does not concur the new SOSC course as it overlaps with one of the Dept's common core course, ECON 2123, Macroeconomics.

Regards,

Leonna



**CarstenHolz-GrievanceAgainstHeadOfEcon-4Dec13.pdf**  
20K

---

**Tony F Chan** <[tonyfchan@ust.hk](mailto:tonyfchan@ust.hk)>

Tue, Jan 14, 2014 at 5:01 PM

To: Carsten Holz <[carstenholz@gmail.com](mailto:carstenholz@gmail.com)>

Cc: Wei SHYY <[weishyy@ust.hk](mailto:weishyy@ust.hk)>, Ka Lok CHAN <[kachan@ust.hk](mailto:kachan@ust.hk)>, Mandy Cheung <[wmcheung@ust.hk](mailto:wmcheung@ust.hk)>

Dear Professor Holz,

I am copying Acting Dean Kalok Chan, who I hope can comment on the status of the case. I am also copying our EVPP Professor Wei Shyy, who should be consulted at this stage.

Tony

-----Original Message-----

From: Carsten Holz [mailto:[carstenholz@gmail.com](mailto:carstenholz@gmail.com)]  
Sent: Tuesday, January 14, 2014 3:41 PM  
To: Tony F Chan  
Subject: Fwd: Initiating grievance procedures against Head of ECON

14 January 2014

From: Carsten Holz, Professor, Social Science Division, HKUST, [socholz@ust.hk](mailto:socholz@ust.hk)  
To: Professor Tony Chan, President, HKUST, [tonyfchan@ust.hk](mailto:tonyfchan@ust.hk)

Re: Grievance against the Department of Economics, Business School, HKUST

Dear President Chan,

in accordance with the Human Resources Circular No. 3/2011 ("Revised Staff Grievance Procedures"), I forward my grievance to you.

I originally submitted my grievance to the Dean of the Business School, by email on 4 December 2013 and, not receiving an acknowledgment, by registered mail on 5 December 2013. As of today, I have not received a response. The staff grievance procedures in paragraph 13 specify that "if a decision is not reached within the one-month period, he/she [the staff member] may ... appeal to the supervisor's supervisor in writing," which I herewith do.

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Ka Lok CHAN** <[kachan@ust.hk](mailto:kachan@ust.hk)>

Tue, Jan 14, 2014 at 5:51 PM

To: Tony F Chan <tonyfchan@ust.hk>, Carsten Holz <carstenholz@gmail.com>  
Cc: Wei SHYY <weishyy@ust.hk>, Mandy Cheung <wmcheung@ust.hk>, Kellee S TSAI <ktsai@ust.hk>, James LEE <jqljzl@ust.hk>, Francis T LUI <fnfntlui@ust.hk>, Siu Fai LEUNG <sfleung@ust.hk>, Ka Lok CHAN <kachan@ust.hk>

Tony,

Prof Carsten Holz has submitted the grievance to me in Dec. As you can see from the attached email, I have shared the grievance with his department head Prof Kelle Tsai, who said she would discuss with Prof Holz and get the curriculum committees of the two departments to look at the matter. Prof Holz was in the email list and has been updated of the status.

Regards,

Kalok

[Quoted text hidden]



**noname.eml**

18K

---

**Carsten Holz** <carstenholz@gmail.com>

Wed, Jan 15, 2014 at 8:29 AM

To: Ka Lok CHAN <kachan@ust.hk>

Cc: Tony F Chan <tonyfchan@ust.hk>, Wei SHYY <weishyy@ust.hk>, Mandy Cheung <wmcheung@ust.hk>, Kellee S TSAI <ktsai@ust.hk>, James LEE <jqljzl@ust.hk>, Francis T LUI <fnfntlui@ust.hk>, Siu Fai LEUNG <sfleung@ust.hk>

I confirm that Kellee cc'ed to me her email of 11 December 2013. Since then (and apart from that email), I have received no communication re this matter.

The grievance procedures set a one-month time limit for a response to my grievance and this deadline passed in early January.

The grievance procedures specify how to proceed and with my email to President Chan of 14 January 2014 I am proceeding accordingly.

Best,

Carsten

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Kellee S TSAI** <ktsai@ust.hk>

Wed, Jan 15, 2014 at 9:55 AM

To: "Carsten Holz (carstenholz@gmail.com)" <carstenholz@gmail.com>

Dear Carsten,

I want to confirm that I am still trying to get the SOSC and ECON committees to meet. Due to travel schedules over x-mas, New Year, the AEA meetings in Philadelphia, and grounded flights in the US, this seems to be the first week that most people are coming back (and even then, one of our curriculum committee members is out of town). ECON's new head, Siu Fai, has expressed support for our working together and I know that Francis also briefed him about the situation as part of ECON's leadership transition.

Best regards,

Kellee

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Carsten Holz** <carstenholz@gmail.com>

Fri, Jan 17, 2014 at 9:24 AM

To: Tony F Chan <tonyfchan@ust.hk>

Dear President Chan,

Professor Kalok Chan's reference to Kellee's email of early December seems to imply that the two curriculum committees talking to each other can somehow address my grievance. I do not think so.

ECON has on the books 31 economics courses and has the right to block any such course, or any related course that SOSC may want to offer.

ECON has consistently done so, and can continue to do so in the future whether the two curriculum committees meet or not. SOSC has on the books 1 economics course.

(1) The current system is an apartheid system where SOSC is at the mercy of ECON in what it can teach or not teach in the discipline of economics (curriculum committees meeting or not). ECON can \*use\* SOSC for courses ECON does not want to teach.

This means that the 6.5 economists in SOSC are second-class citizens. Historically, this has meant we cannot teach any course in our discipline, either because of direct blocking by ECON or because the SOSC division head self-censored and requested us not to teach an economics course. (For example, when I joined HKUST in 1995 I was explicitly asked to in my first year teach 3 courses outside my PhD discipline of economics.)

(2) As I specify in my original grievance, the fact that economists in SOSC cannot teach economics courses but are evaluated by the UASC according to their publications in economics constitutes a double-standard.

I view the double standard (and the underlying apartheid system) as gross injustice and unfairness imposed by the management of the university. It very significantly adversely affects the general welfare (and career) of economists in SOSC.

I continue to request that ECON have no authority to block SOSC courses in the discipline of economics.

Best,  
Carsten  
[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Tony F Chan** <tonyfchan@ust.hk>

Fri, Jan 17, 2014 at 5:36 PM

To: Carsten Holz <carstenholz@gmail.com>

Cc: Wei SHYY <weishyy@ust.hk>, Ka Lok CHAN <kachan@ust.hk>, Kellee S TSAI <ktsai@ust.hk>

Dear Professor Holz,

Your points are noted. I am copying our colleagues who are directly handling your grievance.

[Quoted text hidden]