



**div. acad. review committee**

**Carsten A. Holz** <socholz@ust.hk>

Tue, Mar 6, 2007

To: [Division head, Dean]

Cc: [other academic review committee members]

Dear [DH = division head],

an academic review committee meeting was called last night for today, on the cases of X, Y, and Z.

I cannot evaluate Z and therefore will not review her case. This goes back to W's evaluation several years ago, in which I took part, and after which I decided that I would not again do a review that I am not qualified to do. I cannot personally evaluate Z's research, nor the choice / quality of external reviewers.

I do not feel qualified to properly review X and Y, but am willing to go along in these two cases because I have at least an inkling of their fields.

It's fine with me to completely remove me from the review committee.

--- Presumably we will have the merit review job coming up later this semester. I will not take part in that evaluation.

This is again a decision made earlier, after the last round. I am unable to rank all faculty's r[e]search (which is what the point scheme does) in a fair manner. I have severe reservations about the teaching evaluation that occurs as part of the merit review which, for the sake of brevity, I don't expand on at this point.

Regards,  
Carsten

[Division head] Tue, Mar 6, 2007  
To: "Carsten A. Holz" <socholz@ust.hk>, [Dean]  
Cc: [other academic review committee members]

Dear Carsten,

Wonderful. Thanks.

DH

---

**Academic Review Committee**

DH Wed, Mar 7, 2007  
To: All faculty of Social Science Division <sosc-fac-list@ust.hk>

Dear Colleagues,

Prof. Carsten Holz has withdrawn from the Division's Academic Review Committee, for reasons related to the principles he wishes to follow regarding qualifications for reviewing the academic record of colleagues with different disciplinary backgrounds.

In order to maintain the composition of the Academic Review Committee, which must have an odd number of members for the purpose of voting, I have consulted with the committee chair and members and with the acting dean about a replacement. I have thus asked Prof. V to serve on the Division Academic Review Committee during the remainder of this academic year, and he has kindly agreed to take on this responsibility.

I am grateful to all the committee members for their willingness to carry out the vital task of providing a fair and comprehensive review of colleagues, and will do all in my power to help them complete this task successfully.

Best wishes,

DH